1	KELLY A. JOHNSON	
2	Acting Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources Division	
3	U.S. Department Of Justice ROBERT D. MULLANEY (Cal. Bar No. 116441)	
4	Trial Attorney Environmental Enforcement Section	
5	U.S. Department of Justice 301 Howard Street, Suite 1050 San Francisco, CA 94105	
6	Tel: (415) /44-6491	
7	Fax: (415) 744-6476 E-mail: Robert.Mullaney@usdoj.gov	
8	DEBRA WONG YANG	
9	United States Attorney Central District of California LEON W. WEIDMAN	
10	Chief Civil Division	
11	300 North Los Angeles Street Los Angeles, CA 90012 Tel: (213) 894-2400	
12	Fax: (213) 894-7385	
13	Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America	
14	[Attorneys for Plaintiff California DTSC on next page]	
15		
16	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA WESTERN DIVISION	
17	WESTERN DIVISION	
18	UNITED STATES OF AMERICA) and CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT)	
19	and CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT) OF TOXIC SUBSTANCES) CONTROL,)	
20	Plaintiffs, Civil No.	
21	(
22	V. CONSENT DECREE	
23	ALLEGIANCE HEALTHCARE) CORPORATION and PHILIP) MORRIS USA INC.,)	
24	Defendants.	
25		
26		

BILL LOCKYER Attorney General of the State of California THEODORA BERGER Senior Assistant Attorney General DONALD A. ROBINSON DONALD A. ROBINSON
Deputy Attorney General
ANN RUSHTON (Cal. Bar No. 62597)
Deputy Attorney General
California Department of Justice
300 South Spring Street
Los Angeles, California 90013
Tel: (213) 897-2608
Fax: (213) 897-2802
E-mail: Ann.Rushton@doj.ca.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff California
Department of Toxic Substances Control

TABLE OF CONTENTS

,	
3	I. <u>BACKGROUND</u>
_	II. <u>JURISDICTION</u>
4	III. <u>PARTIES BOUND</u>
5	IV. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>
6	V. <u>STATEMENT OF PURPOSE</u> 6
7	VI. PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS7
8	VII. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE
9	<u>REQUIREMENTS</u> 8
10	VIII. <u>COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFFS</u> 11 -
11	IX. <u>RESERVATION OF RIGHTS</u>
12	X. COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANTS 14
13	XI. <u>EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT; CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION</u> 16 -
14	XII. <u>ACCESS</u> 18 -
15	XIII. ACCESS TO INFORMATION
16	XIV. <u>RETENTION OF RECORDS</u>
17	XV. <u>NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS</u> - 21
18	XVI. <u>EFFECTIVE DATE</u>
19	XVII. <u>RETENTION OF JURISDICTION</u>
20	XVIII. <u>INTEGRATION/APPENDICES</u>
21	XIX. <u>LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT</u> 24
22	XX. <u>SIGNATORIES/SERVICE</u>
23	XXI. <u>FINAL JUDGMENT</u>
24	
25	
26	

27

28

I. BACKGROUND

- A. The United States of America ("United States"), on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA"), and the California Department of Toxic Substances Control ("DTSC") filed a joint complaint in this matter pursuant to Sections 106 and 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607, and Section 7003 of the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act ("RCRA"), 42 U.S.C. § 6973.
- B. The United States and DTSC in their complaint seek, inter alia: (1) reimbursement of costs incurred by EPA, the United States Department of Justice, and DTSC for response actions at the Baldwin Park Operable Unit (Area 2) of the San Gabriel Valley Superfund Sites, Areas 1-4, in Los Angeles County, California ("the BPOU Area"), together with accrued interest; and (2) performance of studies and response work by the defendants at the BPOU Area consistent with the National Contingency Plan, 40 C.F.R. Part 300 (as amended) ("NCP").
- C. Each defendant that has entered into this Consent Decree ("Settling Defendant") does not admit, and specifically denies: (i) any liability to the Plaintiffs arising out of the transactions or occurrences alleged in the complaint; and (ii) that the release or threatened release of hazardous substance(s) at or from the BPOU Area constitutes an imminent or substantial endangerment to the public health or welfare or the environment.
- D. The work required to implement the Record of Decision ("ROD") for the BPOU Area, as supplemented by the Explanation of Significant Differences ("ESD"), is being performed by other parties pursuant to EPA's Unilateral Administrative Order No. 2000-13 (as amended).
- E. The United States, DTSC, and the Settling Defendants agree, and the Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in good faith, that settlement of this matter will avoid

prolonged and complicated litigation between the Parties, and that this Consent Decree is fair, reasonable, and in the public interest.

NOW, THEREFORE, with the consent of the Parties to this Decree, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:

II. JURISDICTION

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345, and 42 U.S.C. §§ 6973(a), 9606, 9607, and 9613(b). This Court also has personal jurisdiction over the Settling Defendants. Venue is proper in this District pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 9613(b) and 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c). Solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree and the underlying complaint, each Settling Defendant waives all objections and defenses that it may have to jurisdiction of the Court or to venue in this District. The Settling Defendants consent to and shall not challenge the terms of this Consent Decree or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree.

III. PARTIES BOUND

2. This Consent Decree applies to and is binding upon the following parties: the United States; DTSC; and each Settling Defendant and its respective successors and assigns. Any change in ownership or corporate status of a Settling Defendant including, but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter such Settling Defendant's responsibilities under this Consent Decree. Each Settling Defendant's obligations under this Consent Decree are independent of the other Settling Defendant's obligations, and each Settling Defendant is entitled to the benefits of this Consent Decree in accordance with its performance of its own obligations hereunder.

IV. DEFINITIONS

3. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Consent Decree which are defined in CERCLA, RCRA, or in regulations promulgated under CERCLA or RCRA shall have the meaning assigned to them in CERCLA or

7 8

6

9 10

1112

13

1415

1617

18 19

2021

2223

24

2526

2728

RCRA or in such regulations. Whenever terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree or in the appendices attached hereto and incorporated hereunder, the following definitions shall apply:

"BPOU Area" shall mean the Baldwin Park Operable Unit (Area 2) of the San Gabriel Valley Superfund Sites, Areas 1-4, in and near the cities of Azusa, Irwindale, and Baldwin Park, in Los Angeles County, California, and depicted generally on the map attached as Appendix A.

"CERCLA" shall mean the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 9601 <u>et seq</u>.

"Certification of Completion" shall mean EPA's written determination that the remedial action has been performed and that the performance standards have been achieved.

"Consent Decree" or "Decree" shall mean this Decree and all appendices attached hereto (listed in Section XVIII). In the event of conflict between this Decree and any appendix, this Decree shall control.

"Day" shall mean a calendar day unless expressly stated to be a working day. "Working day" shall mean a day other than a Saturday, Sunday, or federal holiday. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

"DOJ" shall mean the United States Department of Justice and any successor departments, agencies, or instrumentalities of the United States.

"DTSC" shall mean the California Department of Toxic Substances Control and any predecessor or successor departments or agencies of DTSC.

"DTSC Response Costs" shall mean: (i) all past costs, including, but not limited to, direct and indirect costs that DTSC has incurred at or in connection with the BPOU Area prior to the entry of this Consent Decree, and (ii) all future costs (including, but not limited to, direct and indirect costs) related to the

implementation or oversight of the Work, that DTSC will incur at or in connection with the BPOU Area.

"EPA" shall mean the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any successor departments, agencies, or instrumentalities of the United States.

"EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund" shall mean the Hazardous Substance Superfund established by the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507.

"Explanation of Significant Differences" or "ESD" shall mean the Explanation of Significant Differences relating to the BPOU Area issued by EPA in May 1999. The ESD is attached as Appendix C.

"Interest" shall mean interest at the rate specified for interest on investments of the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund established by 26 U.S.C. § 9507, compounded annually on October 1 of each year, in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a). The applicable rate of interest shall be the rate in effect at the time the interest accrues. The rate of interest is subject to change on October 1 of each year.

"Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by an Arabic numeral or an upper case letter.

"Parties" shall mean the United States, DTSC, and the Settling Defendants.

"Plaintiffs" shall mean the United States and DTSC.

"RCRA" shall mean the Solid Waste Disposal Act, as amended, 42 U.S.C. § 6901 et seq. (also known as the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act).

"ROD" shall mean the EPA Record of Decision and all attachments thereto relating to the interim remedy for the BPOU Area, which was signed by the delegate of the Regional Administrator, EPA Region 9 on March 31, 1994. The ROD is attached as Appendix B.

"Remedial Action" shall mean those activities, except for Operation and Maintenance, undertaken to implement the ROD, as supplemented by the ESD.

"Response Costs" shall mean: (i) all past costs, including, but not limited to,

direct and indirect costs, that the United States has incurred at or in connection 1 2 with the BPOU Area prior to the entry of this Consent Decree, and (ii) all future costs (including, but not limited to, direct and indirect costs) related to the 3 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

implementation or oversight of the Work, that the United States will incur at or in connection with the BPOU Area.

"Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a Roman numeral.

"Settling Defendants" shall mean the Settling Allegiance Healthcare Defendants and the Settling Philip Morris Defendants.

"Settling Allegiance Healthcare Defendants shall mean the following entities: Allegiance Healthcare Corporation, Allegiance Corporation, Baxter Healthcare Corporation, Baxter International, Inc., Baxter Travenol Laboratories, Inc., Baxter Acquisition Sub., Inc., Travenol Laboratories, Inc., American Hospital Supply Corporation, and Cardinal Health, Inc., and all predecessor or successor or related corporate entities bearing potential liability under CERCLA, RCRA, or State law counterparts for matters addressed in this Consent Decree arising in whole or in part from the ownership or operation of the property or facility located at 4401 Foxdale Avenue in Irwindale, California.

"Settling Philip Morris Defendants" shall mean the following entities: Philip Morris USA Inc., successor to Philip Morris Incorporated, and all predecessor or successor or related Philip Morris corporate entities bearing potential liability under CERCLA, RCRA, or State law counterparts for matters addressed in this Consent Decree arising in whole or in part from the ownership or operation of the former U.S. Relay facility at 717 North Coney Avenue in Azusa, California.

"Site" shall mean the San Gabriel Valley Superfund Sites, Areas 1-4, in Los Angeles County, California.

"United States" shall mean the United States of America, including its

departments, agencies, and instrumentalities.

"Work" shall mean all activities required to be performed to implement the ROD, as supplemented by the ESD, or to oversee the implementation of the ROD, as supplemented by the ESD, at or in connection with the BPOU Area.

V. STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

- 4. By entering into this Consent Decree, the mutual objectives of the Parties, as more precisely described in the terms of this Consent Decree, are:
- a. To reach a settlement among the Parties with respect to the BPOU Area that allows each of the Settling Defendants to make a cash payment, which includes a premium, to resolve any claims for civil or administrative liability under Sections 106 and 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607, 9607, and RCRA Section 7003, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, and their respective State law counterparts, for interim response actions and for response costs related to interim response actions incurred and to be incurred at or in connection with the BPOU Area, as provided in Section VIII (Covenants Not to Sue by Plaintiffs) and Section IX (Reservation of Rights) of this Decree;
- b. To resolve any claims of Settling Defendants that could have been asserted against the United States and DTSC with regard to the BPOU Area as provided in Section X (Covenants Not to Sue by Settling Defendants) of this Decree;
- c. To simplify the remaining administrative and judicial enforcement activities concerning the BPOU Area by resolving the United States' and DTSC's claims against the Settling Defendants for interim response actions and for response costs related to interim response actions incurred and to be incurred at or in connection with the BPOU Area, as provided in Section VIII (Covenants Not to Sue by Plaintiffs) and Section IX (Reservation of Rights) of this Decree; and
- d. To provide for contribution protection for the Settling Parties with respect to matters addressed in this Consent Decree pursuant to Section 113(f)(2)

VI. PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS

- 5. Within 30 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree, Allegiance Healthcare Corporation shall pay to EPA \$550,000 in the manner described in this Section.
- 6. Within 30 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree, Philip Morris USA Inc. shall pay to EPA \$1,500,000 in the manner described in this Section.
- 7. Payment shall be made by FedWire Electronic Funds Transfer ("EFT") to the U.S. Department of Justice account in accordance with current EFT procedures, referencing USAO File Number 2003V03651, the EPA Region and Site Spill Number 0927, and DOJ Case Number 90-11-2-354/7. Payment shall be made in accordance with instructions provided to Settling Defendants by the Financial Litigation Unit of the U.S. Attorney's Office in the Central District of California following lodging of the Consent Decree.
- 8. At the time of payment, each Settling Defendant shall send a letter confirming the date and reference number of its FedWire EFT to the United States, EPA, and the Regional Financial Management Officer as provided in Section XV (Notices and Submissions) of this Decree.
- 9. The total amount to be paid pursuant to Paragraphs 5 and 6 shall be deposited in the Site 0927 San Gabriel Valley/Baldwin Park Special Account within the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund to be retained and used to conduct or finance response actions at or in connection with the BPOU Area, or to be transferred by EPA to the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund.
- 10. Within 30 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree, Allegiance Healthcare Corporation shall pay to DTSC \$16,050 in the form of a certified check or checks made payable to Cashier, California Department of Toxic Substances Control, and bearing on its face the docket number of this proceeding.
 - 11. Within 30 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree, Philip

Morris USA Inc. shall pay to DTSC \$44,138 in the form of a certified check or checks made payable to Cashier, California Department of Toxic Substances Control, and bearing on its face the docket number of this proceeding.

12. Each Settling Defendant shall send its certified check, along with a transmittal letter referencing the Baldwin Park Operable Unit, San Gabriel Valley Superfund Sites, Project Nos. 300133, 300345, 300349, and 300350, to:

Department of Toxic Substances Control Accounting/Cashier 1001 I Street, 4th Floor P.O. Box 806 Sacramento, CA 95812-0806

13. Each Settling Defendant's payment to EPA and DTSC includes an amount for: (i) past Response Costs and DTSC Response Costs incurred at or in connection with the BPOU Area; (ii) projected future Response Costs and DTSC Response Costs to be incurred at or in connection with the BPOU Area; and (iii) a premium to cover the risks and uncertainties associated with this settlement, including but not limited to, the risk that total Response Costs and DTSC Response Costs incurred or to be incurred at or in connection with the BPOU Area will exceed the estimated total Response Costs and DTSC Response Costs upon which Settling Defendants' payments are based.

VII. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE REQUIREMENTS

14. <u>Interest on Late Payments.</u> If a Settling Defendant fails to make any payment under Paragraphs 5, 6, 10, or 11 within 30 days of the effective date of this Consent Decree, then that Settling Defendant shall pay Interest on the unpaid balance, commencing on the date that payment is due and accruing through the date of payment. Each Settling Defendant shall make all payments required of that Settling Defendant by this Paragraph in the manner described in Paragraphs 7, 8, and 12 unless otherwise directed in writing by EPA or DTSC.

15. <u>Stipulated Penalty</u>.

a. In addition to the Interest required by Paragraph 14 (Interest on Late Payments), if a Settling Defendant fails to remit the payments to the United States required by Paragraphs 5 and 6 when due, then that Settling Defendant also shall pay stipulated penalties to the United States of \$1,000 per day for each day that its payment is late.

b. Stipulated penalties are due and payable to the United States within 30 days of the date of the demand for payment of the penalties by the United States. All payments to the United States under this Paragraph shall be identified as "stipulated penalties" and shall be made by certified or cashier's check made payable to "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund." The check, or a letter accompanying the check, shall reference the name and address of the party making payment, the Site name, EPA Region and Site Spill Number 0927, USAO File Number 2003V03651, and DOJ Case Number 90-11-2-354/7, and shall be sent to:

EPA - Cincinnati Accounting Operations Attn: Region 9 Receivables P.O. Box 371099M Pittsburgh, PA 15251

- c. In addition to the Interest required by Paragraph 14 (Interest on Late Payments), if a Settling Defendant fails to remit when due the payment to DTSC required of that Settling Defendant by Paragraphs 10 and 11, then that Settling Defendant also shall pay stipulated penalties to DTSC of \$1,000 per day for each day that the payment is late.
- d. Stipulated penalties are due and payable to DTSC within 30 days of the date of the demand for payment of the penalties by DTSC. All payments to DTSC under this Paragraph shall be identified as "stipulated penalties" and shall be made by certified or cashier's check made payable to "Cashier, California Department of Toxic Substances Control." The check, or a letter accompanying the check, shall reference the name and address of the party making payment and the Site name, and shall be sent to:

Department of Toxic Substances Control Accounting/Cashier 1001 I Street, 4th Floor P.O. Box 806 Sacramento, CA 95812-0806

- e. At the time of payment of any stipulated penalties to the United States, the Settling Defendant making the payment shall send copies of check(s), and any accompanying transmittal letter(s), to the United States, EPA, and the Regional Financial Management Officer as provided in Section XV (Notices and Submissions) of this Consent Decree. At the time of payment of any stipulated penalties to DTSC, the Settling Defendant making the payment shall send copies of check(s), and any accompanying transmittal letter(s), to DTSC as provided in Section XV (Notices and Submissions).
- f. Penalties shall accrue as provided in this Paragraph regardless of whether EPA or DTSC has notified the Settling Defendant of the violation or made a demand for payment, but need only be paid upon demand. All penalties shall begin to accrue on the day after payment is due and shall continue to accrue through the date of payment. Nothing herein shall prevent the simultaneous accrual of separate penalties for separate violations of this Consent Decree.
- 16. If the United States or DTSC brings an action to enforce this Consent Decree against a Settling Defendant, that Settling Defendant shall reimburse the Plaintiff(s) bringing the action for all costs of such action, including, but not limited to, costs of attorney time.
- 17. Payments made under this Section shall be in addition to any other remedies or sanctions available to Plaintiffs against a Settling Defendant by virtue of that Settling Defendant's failure to comply with the requirements of this Consent Decree.
- 18. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Section, the United States may, in its unreviewable discretion, waive payment of any portion of the stipulated penalties that have accrued to the United States pursuant to this Consent Decree.

Notwithstanding any other provision of this Section, DTSC may, in its unreviewable discretion, waive payment of any portion of the stipulated penalties that have accrued to DTSC pursuant to this Consent Decree. Payment of stipulated penalties shall not excuse a Settling Defendant from its payment obligation as required by Section VI or from performance of any other requirements of this Consent Decree applicable to that Settling Defendant.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

VIII. COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFFS

19. In consideration of the respective payments that will be made by each Settling Defendant under the terms of this Consent Decree, and except as otherwise specifically provided in Section IX (Reservation of Rights), the United States covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against that Settling Defendant pursuant to Sections 106 and 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607, and Section 7003 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, for performance of the Work and for recovery of Response Costs. In consideration of the payments that will be made by each Settling Defendant under the terms of this Consent Decree, and except as otherwise specifically provided in Section IX (Reservation of Rights), DTSC covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against that Settling Defendant pursuant to Sections 106 and 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606, 9607, and Section 7003 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6973, and their respective State law counterparts, for performance of the Work and for recovery of DTSC Response Costs. These covenants not to sue shall take effect upon the receipt by EPA and DTSC of the payments required by Section VI (Payment of Response Costs) and any amount due under Section VII (Failure to Comply with Consent Decree Requirements). These covenants not to sue accorded to each Settling Defendant are conditioned upon satisfactory performance by that Settling Defendant of its obligations under this Consent Decree. These covenants not to sue extend only to the Settling Defendants and do not extend to any other person.

IX. RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

20. <u>Pre-certification Reservations.</u> Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings in this action or in a new action, or to issue an administrative order seeking to compel Settling Defendants (a) to perform further response actions relating to the BPOU Area or (b) to reimburse the United States for additional costs of response

if, prior to Certification of Completion of the Remedial Action:

- (1) conditions at the BPOU Area, previously unknown to EPA, are discovered, or
- (2) information, previously unknown to EPA, is received, in whole or in part,

and EPA determines that these previously unknown conditions or information together with any other relevant information indicates that the Remedial Action is not protective of human health or the environment. If EPA makes such a determination, DTSC reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings in this action or in a new action, or to issue an administrative order seeking to compel Settling Defendants to reimburse DTSC for additional costs of response.

21. <u>Post-certification Reservations</u>. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings in this action or in a new action, or to issue an administrative order seeking to compel Settling Defendants (a) to perform further response actions relating to the BPOU Area or (b) to reimburse the United States for additional costs of response

if, subsequent to Certification of Completion of the Remedial Action:

- (1) conditions at the BPOU Area, previously unknown to EPA, are discovered, or
- (2) information, previously unknown to EPA, is received, in whole or in part,

and EPA determines that these previously unknown conditions or this information together with other relevant information indicate that the Remedial Action is not protective of human health or the environment. If EPA makes such a determination, DTSC reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, the right to institute proceedings in this action or in a new action, or to issue an administrative order seeking to compel Settling Defendants to reimburse DTSC for additional costs of response.

- 22. For purposes of Paragraph 20, the information and the conditions known to EPA shall include only that information and those conditions known to EPA as of May 31, 1999, the date of the ESD supplementing the ROD, and set forth in the ROD, the ESD, and the administrative record supporting the ROD and the ESD. For purposes of Paragraph 21, the information and the conditions known to EPA shall include only that information and those conditions known to EPA as of the date of Certification of Completion of the Remedial Action, and set forth in the ROD, the ESD, the administrative record supporting the ROD and the ESD, and the post-ROD administrative record.
- 23. General Reservation of Rights. The covenants not to sue set forth in Paragraph 19 do not pertain to any matters other than those expressly specified therein. The United States and DTSC reserve, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights of the United States and DTSC against Settling Defendants with respect to all other matters including, but not limited to, the following:
- (1) claims against a Settling Defendant based on a failure by that Settling Defendant to meet a requirement of this Consent Decree;

- (2) liability of a Settling Defendant arising from the past, present, or future disposal, release, or threat of release of hazardous substances, pollutants, contaminants, or solid wastes outside of the BPOU Area;
- (3) liability of a Settling Defendant for disposal of hazardous substances, pollutants, contaminants, or solid wastes at the BPOU Area by that Settling Defendant after signature of this Consent Decree, other than as provided in the ROD, as supplemented by the ESD, the Remedial Action, or otherwise ordered by EPA;
- (4) liability of a Settling Defendant for damages for injury to, destruction of, or loss of natural resources, and for the costs of any natural resource damage assessments;
 - (5) a Settling Defendant's criminal liability;
- (6) liability of a Settling Defendant for additional operable units at the Site, or a final response action, including, but not limited to, the final Record of Decision for the BPOU Area;
- (7) liability for injunctive relief or administrative order enforcement under Section 106 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9606, for response actions that are not within the BPOU Area; and
- (8) liability for costs incurred or to be incurred that are not within the definition of Response Costs or DTSC Response Costs.
- 24. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States and DTSC retain all authority and reserve all rights to take any and all response actions authorized by law.

X. COVENANTS NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANTS

25. Settling Defendants hereby covenant not to sue and agree not to assert any claims or causes of action against the United States or DTSC, or their contractors or employees, with respect to the Response Costs, DTSC Response Costs, the Work or this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to:

a. any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement from the Hazardous Substance Superfund (established pursuant to the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507) based on CERCLA Sections 106(b)(2), 107, 111, 112, or 113, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606(b)(2), 9607, 9611, 9612, or 9613, or any other provision of law;

- b. any claims arising out of response actions at or in connection with the BPOU Area, including any claims under the United States Constitution, the California Constitution, the Tucker Act, 42 U.S.C. § 1491, the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended, or at common law.
- c. any claims against the United States, including any department, agency, or instrumentality of the United States, under CERCLA Sections 107 or 113 related to the BPOU Area;
- d. any claims against the State of California, including any department, agency, or instrumentality of the State of California, under CERCLA Sections 107 or 113 related to the BPOU Area; or
- e. any claims against the United States or DTSC arising out of response activities at the BPOU Area, including claims based on EPA's and DTSC's selection of response actions, oversight of response activities or approval of plans for such activities.
- 26. Except as provided in Paragraph 28 (Waiver of Claims) and Paragraph 33 (Waiver of Claim-Splitting Defenses), these covenants not to sue shall not apply in the event the United States or DTSC brings a cause of action or issues an order pursuant to the reservations set forth in Paragraph 23, but only to the extent that Settling Defendants' claims arise from the same response action or response costs that the United States or DTSC is seeking pursuant to the applicable reservation.
- 27. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to constitute approval or preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. § 300.700(d).
 - 28. Settling Defendants hereby agree not to assert any CERCLA claims or

causes of action that they may have for all matters relating to Response Costs, DTSC Response Costs, or the Work, including for contribution, against any person other than Settling Defendants' insurance carriers and potentially responsible parties who have received in the past or receive in the future special notice from EPA in connection with the BPOU Area and who are not signatories to this Consent Decree or another Consent Decree in connection with the BPOU Area, for damages or costs of any kind relating to response actions and costs incurred at the BPOU Area, including without limitation, claims under Sections 107 and 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613, common law claims of negligence, contribution, equitable indemnity and restitution, and claims under any other federal, state or local statutory or common law. This waiver shall not apply with respect to any defense, claim, or cause of action that a Settling Defendant may have against any person if such person asserts a claim or cause of action relating to the BPOU Area against such Settling Defendant.

XI. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT; CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

29. Except as expressly provided in Paragraph 28, nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to create any rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any person not a Party to this Consent Decree. The preceding sentence shall not be construed to waive or nullify any rights that any person not a signatory to this Decree may have under applicable law. Except as provided in Paragraph 28, each of the Parties expressly reserves any and all rights (including, but not limited to, any right to contribution), defenses, claims, demands, and causes of action which each Party may have with respect to any matter, transaction, or occurrence relating in any way to the Site against any person not a Party hereto. The Parties intend that neither this Decree nor its contents shall constitute evidence in any proceeding of any liability or obligation whatsoever of any Settling Defendant, except that it may be used by the United States, DTSC, or the Settling Defendants in any action brought to enforce or interpret this Decree and the rights and obligations of the

parties hereunder.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

30. The Parties agree, and by entering this Consent Decree this Court finds, that the Settling Defendants are entitled, as of the effective date of this Consent Decree, to protection from contribution actions or claims as provided by CERCLA Section 113(f)(2), 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2), and its respective State law counterpart, for "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree. For purposes of this Paragraph, "matters addressed" shall mean (a) the Work, (b) all response costs incurred prior to the entry of this Consent Decree by the United States, DTSC, or any other person at or in connection with the BPOU Area, and (c) all response costs related to the implementation or oversight of the Work to be incurred after the entry of this Consent Decree by the United States, DTSC, or any other person at or in connection with the BPOU Area. The "matters addressed" in this Consent Decree do not include those response costs or response actions as to which the United States or DTSC has reserved its rights under this Consent Decree (except for claims for failure to comply with this Decree), in the event that the United States or DTSC asserts rights against Settling Defendants coming within the scope of such reservations.

- 31. The Settling Defendants agree that with respect to any suit or claim for contribution brought by them for matters related to this Consent Decree, they will notify the United States and DTSC in writing no later than 60 days prior to the initiation of such suit or claim.
- 32. The Settling Defendants also agree that with respect to any suit or claim for contribution brought against them for matters related to this Consent Decree, they will notify in writing the United States and DTSC within 10 days of service of the complaint on them. In addition, Settling Defendants shall notify the United States and DTSC within 10 days of service or receipt of any Motion for Summary Judgment and within 10 days of receipt of any order from a court setting a case for trial.

33. In any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States or DTSC for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other relief relating to the Site, Settling Defendants shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, res judicata, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by the United States or DTSC in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, that nothing in this Paragraph affects the enforceability of the covenants not to sue set forth in Section VIII (Covenants Not to Sue by Plaintiffs).

XII. ACCESS

- 34. If any of the Settling Defendants own or control any property where access is needed to implement response activities at the Site, then, commencing on the date of lodging of the Consent Decree, such Settling Defendants shall provide the United States, the State, and their representatives, including EPA and its contractors, with access at all reasonable times to such property, for the purpose of conducting any response activity related to the Site, including, but not limited to, the following activities:
- a. Monitoring, investigation, removal, remedial or other activities at the Site;
- b. Verifying any data or information submitted to the United States or the State;
 - c. Conducting investigations relating to contamination at or near the Site;
 - d. Obtaining samples;
- e. Assessing the need for, planning, or implementing additional response actions at or near the Site;
- f. Inspecting and copying records, operating logs, contracts, or other documents maintained or generated by Settling Defendants or their agents, consistent with Section XIII (Access to Information); and

6 7

5

8 9 10

11 12

14

15

13

16 17

18 19

20

21 22

23 24

25

26

27

28

- g. Assessing Settling Defendants' compliance with this Consent Decree.
- 35. Notwithstanding any provision of this Consent Decree, the United States and the State of California retain all of their access authorities and rights, including enforcement authorities related thereto, under CERCLA, RCRA, and any other applicable statute or regulations.

XIII. ACCESS TO INFORMATION

- 36. Settling Defendants shall provide to EPA and DTSC, upon request, copies of all documents and information within their possession or control or that of their contractors or agents relating to activities at the Site or to the implementation of this Consent Decree, including, but not limited to, sampling, analysis, chain of custody records, manifests, trucking logs, receipts, reports, sample traffic routing, correspondence, or other documents or information related to the Site.
 - 37. Confidential Business Information and Privileged Documents.
- a. Settling Defendants may assert business confidentiality claims covering part or all of the documents or information submitted to Plaintiffs under this Consent Decree to the extent permitted by and in accordance with Section 104(e)(7) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9604(e)(7), and 40 C.F.R. § 2.203(b). Documents or information determined to be confidential by EPA will be accorded the protection specified in 40 C.F.R. Part 2, Subpart B. If no claim of confidentiality accompanies documents or information when they are submitted to EPA and DTSC, or if EPA has notified Settling Defendants that the documents or information are not confidential under the standards of Section 104(e)(7) of CERCLA, or 40 C.F.R. Part 2, Subpart B, the public may be given access to such documents or information without further notice to Settling Defendants.
- b. The Settling Defendants may assert that certain documents, records and other information are privileged under the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege recognized by federal law. If the Settling Defendants assert such a

1 pr
2 fo
3 do
4 fin
5 na
6 th
7 D
8 ge

privilege in lieu of providing documents, they shall provide the Plaintiffs with the following: (1) the title of the document, record, or information; (2) the date of the document, record, or information; (3) the name, title, affiliation (e.g., company or firm), and address of the author of the document, record, or information; (4) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; (5) a description of the subject of the document, record, or information; and (6) the privilege asserted by Settling Defendants. However, no document, report or other information created or generated pursuant to the requirements of the Consent Decree shall be withheld on the grounds that it is privileged.

38. No claim of confidentiality shall be made with respect to any data, including, but not limited to, all sampling, analytical, monitoring, hydrogeologic, scientific, chemical, or engineering data, or any other documents or information evidencing conditions at or around the Site.

XIV. <u>RETENTION OF RECORDS</u>

- 39. Until 10 years after the Settling Defendants' receipt of EPA's notification, transmitted pursuant to Paragraph 42, of the issuance of EPA's Certification of Completion of the Work, each Settling Defendant shall preserve and retain all records and documents now in its possession or control, or which come into its possession or control, that relate in any manner to response actions taken at the BPOU Area or liability of any person for response actions conducted and to be conducted at the BPOU Area, regardless of any corporate retention policy to the contrary.
- 40. At the conclusion of this document retention period, Settling Defendants shall notify the United States and DTSC at least 90 days prior to the destruction of any such records or documents, and, upon request by the United States or DTSC, Settling Defendants shall deliver any such records or documents to EPA or DTSC. The Settling Defendants may assert that certain documents, records and other information are privileged under the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege

recognized by federal law. If the Settling Defendants assert such a privilege, they shall provide the Plaintiffs with the following: (1) the title of the document, record, or information; (2) the date of the document, record, or information; (3) the name, title, affiliation (e.g., company or firm), and address of of the author of the document, record, or information; (4) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; (5) a description of the subject of the document, record, or information; and (6) the privilege asserted by Settling Defendants. However, no document, report or other information created or generated pursuant to the requirements of the Consent Decree shall be withheld on the grounds that it is privileged.

41. Each Settling Defendant hereby certifies individually that, to the best of its knowledge and belief, after thorough inquiry, it has not altered, mutilated, discarded, destroyed or otherwise disposed of any records, documents or other information relating to its potential liability regarding the BPOU Area since notification of potential liability by the United States or DTSC or the filing of suit against it regarding the BPOU Area, and that it has fully complied with any and all EPA requests for information pursuant to Section 104(e) and 122(e) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9604(e), 9622(e), and Section 3007 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6927.

XV. NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS

42. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, written notice is required to be given or a report or other document is required to be sent by one Party to another, it shall be directed to the individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those individuals or their successors give notice of a change to the other Parties in writing. All notices and submissions shall be considered effective upon receipt, unless otherwise provided. Written notice as specified herein shall constitute complete satisfaction of any written notice requirement of the Consent Decree with respect to the United States, EPA, DTSC, and the Settling Defendants, respectively.

As to the United States:

1	Environment and Natural Resources Division
2	U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611, Ben Franklin Station Washington, D.C. 20044
3	Washington, D.C. 20044 Re: DJ # 90-11-2-354/7
4	and
5	Robert D. Mullaney
6	Trial Attorney Environmental Enforcement Section
7	U.S. Department of Justice 301 Howard Street, Suite 1050 San Francisco, CA 94105
8	As to EPA:
9	Lewis C. Maldonado, ORC-3
10	Assistant Regional Counsel United States Environmental Protection Agency
11	75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105
12	and
13	
14	Wayne Praskins, SFD-7-3 EPA Project Coordinator United States Environmental Protection Agency
15	United States Environmental Protection Agency 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105
16	As to the Regional Financial Management Officer:
17	Joe Schmidt, PMD-5
18	United States Environmental Protection Agency 75 Hawthorne Street
19	San Francisco, CA 94105
20	As to DTSC:
21	
22	Jacalyn Spiszman DTSC Project Coordinator
23	DTSC Project Coordinator Department of Toxic Substances Control 5796 Corporate Avenue
24	Cypress, CA 90630
25	and
26	Ann Rushton
27	Office of the Attorney General 300 South Spring Street
28	Los Angeles, CA 90013

1	As to the Settling Philip Morris Defendants:
2	Manning Gasch, Jr. Hunton & Williams 951 E. Byrd Street Richmond, VA 23019
3	951 E. Byrd Street Richmond, VA, 23019
4	racimona, VII 25015
5	As to the Settling Allegiance Healthcare Defendants:
6	George Kokkines
7 8	George Kokkines Senior Counsel, Litigation Cardinal Health, Inc. 1430 Waukegan Road McGaw Park, Illinois 60085
9	and
10	Charles A. Echols Director, Environment, Health and Safety Cardinal Health, Inc.
11	Cardinal Health, Inc. 1430 Waukegan Road MP KB-B3
12	MP KB-B3 McGaw Park, IL 60085-6787
13	
14	XVI. <u>EFFECTIVE DATE</u>
15	43. The effective date of this Consent Decree shall be the date upon which
16	this Consent Decree is entered by the Court, except as otherwise provided herein.
17	XVII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION
18	44. This Court retains jurisdiction over this matter for the purpose of
19	interpreting and enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree.
20	XVIII. <u>INTEGRATION/APPENDICES</u>
21	45. This Consent Decree and its appendices constitute the final, complete
22	and exclusive agreement and understanding among the Parties with respect to the
23	settlement embodied in this Consent Decree. The Parties acknowledge that there
24	are no representations, agreements, or understandings relating to the settlement
25	other than those expressly contained in this Consent Decree. The following
26	appendices are attached to and incorporated into this Consent Decree:
27	"Appendix A" is the map of the BPOU Area;
28	"Appendix B" is a copy of the ROD; and

"Appendix C" is a copy of the ESD.

XIX. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

- 46. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than thirty (30) days for public notice and comment. The United States reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations which indicate that the Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. Settling Defendants consent to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.
- 47. If for any reason the Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in the form presented, this agreement is voidable at the sole discretion of any Party and the terms of the agreement may not be used as evidence in any litigation between the Parties.

XX. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE

- 48. Each undersigned representative of a Settling Defendant to this Consent Decree, the Assistant Attorney General for the Environment and Natural Resources Division of the United States Department of Justice, or his delegate, and the Deputy Attorney General of the California Department of Justice certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and legally bind such Party to this document.
- 49. Each Settling Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree unless the United States has notified the Settling Defendants in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.
- 50. Each Settling Defendant shall identify, on the attached signature page, the name, address and telephone number of an agent who is authorized to accept service of process by mail on behalf of that Party with respect to all matters arising under or relating to this Consent Decree. Settling Defendants hereby agree to accept service in that manner and to waive the formal service requirements set

1	forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local
2	rules of this Court, including, but not limited to, service of a summons.
3	XXI. <u>FINAL JUDGMENT</u>
4	51. Upon approval and entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, this
5	Consent Decree shall constitute a final judgment between and among the United
6	States and the Settling Defendants and between and among DTSC and the Settling
7	Defendants. The Court finds that there is no just reason for delay and therefore
8	enters this judgment as a final judgment under Fed. R. Civ. P. 54 and 58.
9	
10	
11	Dated:
12	United States District Judge
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27 28	
40	

1	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES enter into this Consent Decree in the	
2	matter of United States and California Department of Toxic Substances Control v	
3	Allegiance Healthcare Corporation and Philip Morris USA Inc., relating to the	
4	BPOU Area.	
5		
6	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA	
7		
8		
9	Dated:	
10	77 11 A 7 1	
11	Kelly A. Johnson Acting Assistant Attorney General Environment and Natural Resources	
12	Division Division	
13	U.S. Department of Justice Washington, D.C. 20530	
14		
15		
16	Dated:	
17	Robert D. Mullaney	
18	Robert D. Mullaney Trial Attorney Environmental Enforcement Section	
19	Environment and Natural Resources Division	
20	U.S. Department of Justice 301 Howard Street, Suite 1050 San Francisco, California 94105	
21	San Francisco, California 94105	
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

1		
2		
3	Dated:	
4		Keith Takata Director, Superfund Division
5		Region IX II S Environmental Protection Agency
6		Keith Takata Director, Superfund Division Region IX U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 75 Hawthorne Street San Francisco, CA 94105
7		San Trancisco, CA 74103
8		
9	Dated:	
10		Lewis C. Maldonado Assistant Regional Counsel
11		Lewis C. Maldonado Assistant Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region IX San Francisco, CA 94105
12		San Francisco, CA 94105
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27 28		
28		
	4	

1	FOR THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTM CONTROL	MENT OF TOXIC SUBSTANCES
2		
3	Dated:	
4		Thomas Cota, Chief Southern California Cleanup Operations
5		Branch, Cypress Office Department of Toxic Substances Control
6		Thomas Cota, Chief Southern California Cleanup Operations Branch, Cypress Office Department of Toxic Substances Control 5796 Corporate Avenue Cypress, California 90630
7		ejpress, cumomiu y oce
8		
9	Dated:	
10		Ann Rushton Deputy Attorney General
11		Deputy Attorney General California Department of Justice 300 South Spring Street Los Angeles, California 90013
12		Los Angeles, California 90013
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	1	

1 2	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in the matter of United States and State of California Department of Toxic Substances Control v. Allegiance Healthcare Corporation and Philip Morris USA Inc., relating to the BPOU Area.
3	Bi Oo Alea.
4	
5	FOR ALLEGIANCE HEALTHCARE CORPORATION
6	Datada
7	Dated:
8	Charles A. Echols Director, Environment, Health and Safety Cardinal Health, Inc. 1430 Waukegan Road MP KB-B3
10	MP KB-B3 5-6787
11	3-0707
12	
13	Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:
14	
15	The Prentice-Hall Corporation System, Inc. 33 North LaSalle Street Chicago, IL 60602
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

1 2 3	THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in the matter of United States and State of California Department of Toxic Substances Control v Allegiance Healthcare Corporation and Philip Morris USA Inc., relating to the BPOU Area.	
4 5	FOR PHILIP MORRIS USA INC.	
6	Dated:	
8	John E. Holleran Senior Vice President Compliance and Brand Integrity Philip Morris USA Inc.	
10	1	
11	Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Above-signed Party:	
12	Manning Gasch, Jr. Hunton & Williams	
13	951 E. Byrd Street	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18 19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		